



JAMES SORENSEN
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
DIRECTOR

KURT BRADBURN
MAYOR

MATTHEW HUISH
CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

MEMORANDUM

February 7, 2019

To: Planning Commission
From: Community Development Department
Subject: Duluth Trading Site Plan Review
11376 S. State St.
[Community #9 – South Towne]

SPR-10-18-5551
Zone: CBD
0.91 acres

HEARING NOTICE: *This item has not been noticed to property owners within 500 feet of the subject area.*

PROPERTY CASE HISTORY	
Case Number	Case Summary
SPR-12-10-1627	The Planning Commission reviewed preliminary site plan for Phase 1 of the 114 Retail Center in January 2011.
SPR-05-12-2338	The Planning Commission reviewed preliminary site plan for Phase 2 of the 114 Retail Center in July 2012.
SPR-11-12-2634	An application for a review of revised architectural design, colors, and materials for the retail shops in Phase 2 of the 114 Retail Center.
SPR-07-12-2427	Preliminary Site Plan Review was determined to be complete by the Planning Commission in July 2012 for a Longhorn Steakhouse located at on the pad site. The project was never completed.
SPR-03-18-5373	Preliminary Site Plan Review was determined to be complete by the Planning Commission in May 2018 for the IFly Indoor Skydiving Facility located on the pad site. The project was never completed.

DESCRIPTION OF REQUEST

The applicant is requesting that the Planning Commission review and approve the site plan and the proposed building architectural design, building materials and colors for a proposed retail store in the CBD zoning district. The Planning Commission is the land use approval body for these actions.

BACKGROUND

Mr. Jay Moore, with Oppidan Investment Co., and Mr. Richard Piggott of Kimley-Horn, are proposing the construction of a Duluth Trading Company retail development on an existing, vacant pad site lot

at the 114 Retail Center, just south of Scheels. The proposed project would complete the 114 Retail Center project. Commercial retail sales is a permitted use in the Central Business District (CBD) zoning district. All of the surrounding property within Sandy City limits is zoned CBD. A community meeting was not held for this application because it is a permitted use and there are no residential properties nearby. The CBD zoning district requires that the Planning Commission approve the building architectural design, materials, and colors, after consideration from the Civic Center Architectural Design Review Committee.

ANALYSIS

Access. The access to the pad site is through the existing 114 Retail Center, through the parking lot driveways. Street access for the One-14 Center is from existing driveways, one on State Street and two on Auto Mall Drive, which are adequate for the center and this additional use.

Parking. This pad site development will add 44 new parking spaces to the 114 Retail Center, which is covered by a shared parking agreement that was approved for the 114 Retail Center when it was developed. These 44 new stalls will be in addition to the parking that already exists at the center, all of which is shared and was approved during the original application for the 114 Retail Center.

Landscaping. New landscaping will be installed within the one-acre pad site that is comparable in design, quality and maturity with the existing landscaping at the 114 Retail Center. The current plans show several landscape islands that break up the parking on the east side of the building, however there are no trees currently being shown. Staff recommends that trees, along with other low-rise vegetation be planted in each of the islands to provide visual interest to the east façade of the building.

Fencing. The only fencing to be added to this pad lot is the masonry wall that will serve as the garbage enclosure on the south side of the building.

Signs. Signage is usually reviewed and approved in a separate application and is not a part of this site plan review. The signage application, in this case, is being reviewed concurrent to the site plan. Two points need to be mentioned relative to this application. First, the 114 Retail Center has a Sign Theme that was approved in the past. Because of its proximity to the freeway, the sign theme has allowed the Center to have multi-tenant pylon signs, which currently exist. Secondly, the only new signage proposed for this pad site is the building wall and projecting signs, which will be discussed as part of a separate agenda item on this meeting's agenda.

Architectural Design & Materials.

The proposed retail store building is subject to the requirements of the Sandy City Architectural Design Standards for commercial buildings. The CBD zoning of the property triggers review of the building architecture, colors and materials by the Civic Center Architectural Design Review Committee, prior to consideration by the Planning Commission. Staff has been working with the project designers since the initial contact with the City to facilitate this nationally branded building prototype for Duluth Trading Company to blend with the Sandy City design requirements, and much progress has been made. The building's design was reviewed by the Sandy City Architectural Design Review Committee at a meeting held on December 12, 2018. (Please see the attached meeting minutes and architect's letter of December 7, 2018, explaining the design concept for the building.) The committee generally liked the proposed building's design, colors, building materials, and the site layout, and unanimously recommended approval to the Planning Commission, with recommendations for further refinement.

Duluth Trading Company uses three different building prototypes nationally and the one selected by the company and the retail center owners for this location is named “Old Factory,” which is derived from the factory buildings of the early 20th century. Typical of those buildings were exposed concrete framed structures with masonry infill walls. In the proposed building these elements are represented by replacing the concrete frame with CMU piers and horizontal bands, creating rectangular frames. Within these frames, the usual CMU “infill” walls are proposed to be replaced with brick infill in two different colors, in an effort to better blend with the retail center’s existing buildings. Two brick “chimneys” are also part of the prototype design.

Three architectural issues need to be considered by the Planning Commission as part of this proposed building’s review: building articulation; roof top mechanical unit screening; and foundational landscaping.

Building Articulation

This proposed building follows the prototypical form of a two story rectangular box. The Sandy City Architectural Design requirements specify, “Building articulation will be used to enhance the visual interest of buildings which are viewable by the public”. Reasonable building articulation can be accomplished through utilizing combinations of: façade modulation; use of engaged columns or other expressions of structural systems; horizontal and vertical divisions; dividing facades into storefronts; providing projections; and varying rooflines. The most common way to express building articulation is to modulate the exterior walls by joggling the building faces in and out, usually by two foot or more variations. Doing this would significantly deviate from the design prototype selected by the applicant. In this case, the architect has incorporated the use of varied materials and colors to help express the structural system of the “frame and infill” construction of early factory buildings. He has also proposed that the vertical “concrete piers” (or columns) project out from the building face by 8 inches. In considering the proposed building articulation, the Architectural Design Review Committee also suggested that building exterior lighting of the vertical “piers or columns” be incorporated into the design, which to date has not been done.

Roof Top Mechanical Unit Screening

The preferred method to screen roof top units (RTU’s) is to raise the surrounding building parapets to be level or above the tallest RTU or vent on a flat roofed structure. Staff suggested this, but the architect asserted that doing so would significantly change the building form by changing the height to length to depth ratios. He asserted that the building would appear as vertically out of scale. The issue involves about one and a half feet of additional wall height to bring the parapet to be level with the six proposed RTU’s needed for the building. The architect has proposed that instead of raising the parapets, that individual architectural screens be built around each RTU, which would each project approximately 1.5 feet above the parapet. This solution is what is represented in the attached building elevations. Staff generally rejects individual RTU screens in lieu of a more comprehensive solution, such as corralling all the RTU’s together and doing one screen curtain around the group, which the architect has also rejected. Staff suggests that this is really just a cost issue. Due to the highly visible location of this site from 11400 South Street and I-15, and the building being raised up as it is on the site, that the raised parapet solutions is most appropriate.

Foundational Landscaping and Landscaping

The design review committee was concerned about the lack of foundational landscaping proposed for the building, between the parking lot and particularly the east side of the building. The Sandy City Architectural Design Requirements state “Landscaping around the base of the building is recommended to soften the edge between the parking lot and building and also to discourage graffiti.” The committee members discussed alternatives to placing foundational landscaping along

the east side of the building, which included adding two new landscape islands within the proposed row of parking stalls that abut the east side of the building and then adding trees to these and the two landscape islands already shown along this side of the building. The committee reasoned that doing this would help soften the edge along the building and parking lot and also help with addressing building articulation.

The Planning Commission has final decision authority relative to all aspects of the Architectural Design Requirements.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission **approve** the preliminary site plan for the proposed Duluth Trading Company Retail Development and **approve** the building architectural design, building materials and colors as proposed, based on the following findings and subject to the following conditions:

Findings

1. That the various City Departments and Divisions, including the City Engineer and the Transportation Engineer, have preliminarily approved the proposed site plan.
2. That the proposed building architectural design, colors, and building materials generally meet the Sandy City Architectural Design Requirements, subject to further refinement with staff and subject to the recommended conditions of approval, listed below.

Conditions

1. That the developer proceed through the final site plan review process with staff prior to the start of any construction (including payment of development fees and posting of an appropriate bond to guarantee completion of all required improvements on and off the site), according to the Site Plan Review Procedures Handout. The final site plan shall be in compliance with all Development Code requirements and those modifications required by the Planning Commission.
2. That the development comply with all Building & Safety, Fire and Life Safety Codes applicable to this type of use.
3. All utility boxes (i.e. transformers, switch gear, telephone, cable tv, etc.) shall be shown on the site plan and shall be placed underground or moved behind the front setback (minimum of 30 feet from the front property line) and screened from view. Each box shall be shown in its exact location and shall be noted with its exact height, width and length and approved by staff.
4. That the architectural design, colors and materials proposed for this development and as approved by the Planning Commission as complying with the Sandy City Architectural Design Standards be finalized with staff prior to the issuance of a building permit.
5. That the developer be responsible for the placement of a temporary 6 foot high chain link fence around the perimeter of the project during the construction phase of the project for security. Said fence shall also be required to include fabric to prohibit blowing dust problems, if it becomes necessary or if it is required by the Community Development Department during Site Plan Review.

6. That the applicant comply with the Sandy City Noise Ordinance.
7. That the applicant comply with all department requirements as noted in all Preliminary Review letters prior to submittal for final site plan review.
8. That the applicant work with planning staff to further refine the final landscaping plan to address the design committee’s concern about building articulation on the two long sides of the building, adding vertical landscaping in the form of trees.
9. That the applicant work with staff to further refine the plans for the building exterior to incorporate the design committee’s recommendation to provide exterior building lighting to enhance the vertical piers on the two long walls of the building.
10. That the building’s parapet wall be increased approximately 1.5 feet in height to adequately screen the six proposed RTU’s.

Planner:



Mitch Vance
Planner



Douglas Wheelwright
Development Services Manager

Reviewed by:



Brian McCuiston
Planning Director